

1 Ramon Rossi Lopez (admitted *pro hac vice*)
2 (CA Bar No. 86361)
3 LOPEZ McHUGH LLP
4 100 Bayview Circle, Suite 5600
5 Newport Beach, CA 92660
6 rlopez@lopezmchugh.com

7 Mark S. O'Connor (011029)
8 BEUS GILBERT PLLC
9 701 N 44th Street
10 Phoenix, AZ 85008
11 Telephone: 480.429-3019
12 moconnor@beusgilbert.com

13 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

14 James R. Condo (#005867)
15 Kristine L. Gallardo (033975)
16 SNELLM & WILMER L.L.P.
17 One Arizona Center
18 400 E. Van Buren, Suite 1900
19 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2202
20 Telephone: 602.382.6000
Facsimile: 602.382.6070
jcondo@swlaw.com
kgallardo@swlaw.com

21 Richard B. North, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)
22 Georgia Bar No. 545599
23 Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
24 Georgia Bar No. 446986
25 NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
26 SCARBOROUGH LLP
27 201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700
28 Atlanta, GA 30363
Telephone: 404.322.6000
Facsimile: 404.322.6050
richard.north@nelsonmullins.com
matthew.lerner@nelsonmullins.com

29 *Attorneys for Defendants C. R. Bard, Inc. and*
30 *Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.*

31 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

32 DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

33 IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products
34 Liability Litigation,

35 No. 2:15-MD-02641-DGC

36 **THE PARTIES' JOINT REPORT
37 ON THE SETTLEMENT STATUS
38 OF CASES**

1 Pursuant to Case Management Order No. 42 (Doc. 164343), the parties submit this
2 monthly report concerning the settlement status of cases pending in this MDL:

3 **I. TRACK 1 CASES**

4 On July 26th, the parties provided the Court with a list of cases that have been
5 resolved in principle pursuant to an executed release or term sheet (Doc. 19798-1). The
6 parties have minimal changes to the Track 1 list.

7 The following cases have been identified as erroneously listed on Track 1 and should
8 now be listed on Track 2:

9

10

11

- Lisa Smullen v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al. (CV-15-01900-PHX-DGC)
- Casey Wyatt v. C. R. Bard et al. (CV-15-01628-PHX-DGC)
- Christine Lorde v. C. R. Bard et al. (CV-15-02446-PHX-DGC)
- Catherine Rowden v. C. R. Bard et al. (CV-15-02091-PHXC-DGC)

12 The following case was also listed erroneously on Track 1; however, Plaintiff's
13 counsel as recently learned that the Plaintiff has passed away.

14

15

- Maureen L. Wallace v. C. R. Bard, Inc. and Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc., United
States District Court, District Court of Arizona, Phoenix Division, CV-16-00392-
PHX-DGC

16 For the balance of the cases on Track 1 the parties are continuing their efforts to
17 finalize the settlements.

18 **II. TRACK 2 CASES**

19 On July 26th, the parties provided the Court with a list of cases that are the subject
20 of substantive settlement negotiations, with a likelihood of ultimately settling (Doc. 19798-
21 2). One or more of the parties have concluded that further settlement efforts in some of
22 those cases are not warranted at this time and that the cases should move to Track 3. Those
23 cases are listed in Schedule "A" (cases proposed for remand by the JPML) and Schedule
24 "B" (direct-filed cases appropriate for transfer to the designated jurisdiction). Settlement
25 discussions are continuing in the remaining cases previously identified in Track 2. Since
26 the date of the last report, the Defendants' attorneys have collected medical records for over
27 2800 cases that are currently in Track 2, and have had meetings and discussions with
28 multiple attorneys representing the Plaintiffs, including a mediation concerning hundreds

1 of Track 2 cases. Those discussions are ongoing, and the parties remain hopeful that many
2 – if not all – of those cases will ultimately be settled before November 1, 2019, when all
3 cases for which neither a release nor term sheet has been executed will be recommended to
4 the JPML for remand or will be transferred under §1404(a) in accordance with CMO No.
5 42 .

6 **III. TRACK 3 CASES**

7 In Case Management Order No. 42, the Court stated that “[a]ny case in either track
8 may be removed from the track and from this MDL upon counsel for either side concluding
9 that further settlement efforts in the case are not warranted.” (Doc. 16343 at 6). Counsel
10 for one or both sides has made that determination regarding a number of cases.

11 **A. Cases Transferred into the MDL by the JPML**

12 Those cases originally transferred to this MDL by the JPML, which are therefore
13 eligible for remand by the Panel, are listed in Schedule “A”.

14 **B. Cases Directly Filed in this Court**

15 Those cases that were direct-filed in this Court and are ripe for transfer to the
16 designated districts are listed in Schedule “B”. This schedule also notes those cases where
17 subject matter jurisdiction does not exist. The parties will file a joint report on September
18 6, 2019: (1) stating what should be done with the Track 3 cases that lack subject matter
19 jurisdiction and (2) addressing the subject matter jurisdiction issues in *Vollick*, CV-17-2588,
20 *Dukes*, CV-19-1348, and *Fuller*, CV-18-1414. (Doc. 19881). Unless otherwise noted, the
21 jurisdiction identified for transfer is the one listed in the short form complaint. This
22 schedule further identifies those cases where a complete Profile Form has not been served.
23 The Defendants’ respectfully request that the Court enter an order requiring those Plaintiffs
24 who have not served a complete Profile Form to do so within twenty (20) days.

25 The Defendants also request that the remand/transfer order for these cases
26 specifically preserve their right to challenge venue and personal jurisdiction upon remand,
27 as the Court did in the previous remand/transfer order (Doc. 19899).

28

Respectfully submitted, this 3rd of September, 2019.

LOPEZ McHUGH, LLP

**NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP**

By: s/ Ramon Rossi Lopez

Ramon Rossi Lopez
(admitted *pro hac vice*)
CA Bar No. 86361
LOPEZ MCHUGH LLP
100 Bayview Circle, Suite 5600
Newport Beach, California 92660

Mark S. O'Connor (011029)
BEUS GILBERT PLLC
701 N 44th Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85008

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

By: *s/ Richard B. North*

Richard B. North, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Georgia Bar No. 545599
Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Georgia Bar No. 446986
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &
SCARBOROUGH LLP
201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700
Atlanta, GA 30363

James R. Condo (005867)
Kristine L. Gallardo (033975)
SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.
One Arizona Center
400 E. Van Buren, Suite 1900
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2202

Attorneys for C. R. Bard, Inc. and Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 3, 2019, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will automatically send email notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

/s/ Richard B. North